## Appellate Case: 12-1445

Albany

Atlanta

Brussels

Denver

Los Angeles

Miami

New York

DAVID SKAGGS Direct Phone: 303.634.4306 Direct Fax: 303.634.4400



1400 Wewatta Street • 7<sup>th</sup> Floor Denver, CO 80202 Tel: 303.634.4000 mckennalong.com

Date Filed: 08/26/2013 Page: 1

Northern Virginia

Orange County Rancho Santa Fe

San Diego

San Francisco

Seoul

Washington, DC

EMAIL ADDRESS dskaggs@mckennalong.com

August 26, 2013

## FILED VIA ECF SYSTEM

Honorable Elisabeth A. Shumaker Clerk, U. S. Court of Appeals for the 10<sup>th</sup> Circuit Byron White U.S. Courthouse 1823 Stout Street Denver, CO 80257

> Re: Citation of Supplemental Authorities, Fed. R. App. P. 28(j) Kerr et al., v. Hickenlooper, No. 12-1445

Dear Madam Clerk:

The following cases, decided since the Plaintiffs-Respondents' Response to Governor's Opening Brief (the "Response") was filed, are brought to the Court's attention pursuant to Fed. R. App. P. 28(j). The opinions address questions of standing and justiciability under the political question doctrine ("PQD"), which are discussed in the Response at 36-54 (standing) and 20-26 (justiciability/PQD).

In *United States v. Windsor*, 133 S. Ct. 2675 (2013), the Court accorded appellate standing and allowed the amicus/intervenor, Bipartisan Legal Advisory Group, to defend the constitutionality of the Defense of Marriage Act. The Court invoked the concept of "prudential standing," not to further *limit* standing, as in *Warth v. Seldin*, 422 U.S. 490 (1975), but to *expand* what is permissible under traditional Article III standing jurisprudence. *See Windsor*, 133 S. Ct. at 2684-89. This approach contrasts with the Appellant's reliance on *Warth. See* Governor's Opening Brief at 28.

The *Windsor* opinion transitions to a treatment of justiciability, citing *Zivotofsky v. Clinton*, 132 S. Ct. 1421 (2012), for courts' duty to decide the constitutionality of acts of Congress, without using possible political implications and the PQD as an excuse to avoid that duty. *See Windsor*, 133 S. Ct. at 2688. The justiciability of the statutory question in *Windsor* is analogous to the justiciability of the constitutionality of the Colorado Taxpayer Bill of Rights here.

*NLRB v. New Vista Nursing & Rehabilitation*, 719 F.3d 203 (3d Cir. 2013), includes an instructive treatment of certain of the six PQD criteria set out in *Baker v. Carr*, 396 U.S. 186, 198 (1962). Quoting *Zivotofsky*, the Third Circuit explained that deciding what a particular

Clerk, U. S. Court of Appeals for the 10<sup>th</sup> Circuit August 26, 2013 Page 2

constitutional provision means is "... merely an exercise of our judicial authority 'to say what the law is." *See New Vista*, 719 F.3d at 218. That exercise implied no "disrespect" for a coordinate branch, violated no explicit assignment to a political branch, and was informed by manageable judicial standards. A similar analysis should obtain in this case regarding interpretation of Article IV, Section 4 of the U. S. Constitution and of the Colorado Enabling Act.

Respectfully submitted,

Attorney for Plaintiffs-Respondents

## DES/lfk

cc: Attorneys for Defendant-Petitioner: William Allen (will.allen@state.co.us) Jonathan Patrick Fero (jon.fero@state.co.us) Stephanie Lindquist Scoville (Stephanie.scoville@state.co.us) Kathleen Spalding (kit.spalding@state.co.us) Daniel D. Domenico, Esq. (dan.domenico@state.co.us) Frederick R. Yarger, Esq. (fred.yarger@state.co.us) Bernie Buescher, Esq. (Bernie.buescher@state.co.us) Megan Paris Rundlet, Esq. (megan.rundlet@state.co.us)

> Attorneys for Amici Curiae: Melissa Hart(melissa.hart@colorado.edu) David Benjamin Kopel(<u>david@i2i.org</u>) John M. Bowlin (john.bowlin@dgslaw.com Emily L. Droll (Emily.droll@dgslaw.com) Andrew M. Low (Andrew.low@dgslaw.com) D'Arcy Winston Straub(dstraub@ecentral.com) Ilva Shapiro (ishapiro@cato.org) James Martin Manley (jmanley@mountainstateslegal.com) Harold Haddon (hhaddon@hmflaw.com) Laura Kastetter(<u>lkastetter@hmflaw.com</u>) Matthew Douglas (matthew.douglas@aporter.com) Nathaniel J. Hake(Nathaniel.hake@aporter.com) Paul Rodney (paul.rodney@aporter.com) Holly Elizabeth Sterrett (holly.sterrett@aporter.com) Joseph Guerra (jguerra@sidley.com) Kathleen Moriarty Mueller (kmueller@sidley.com) Catherine Carla Engberg (engberg@smwlaw.com) Richard A. Westfall (rwestfall@halewestfall.com)

DN 32253175.1